



Appendix E

Route Options
Assessment MCA
Tables - Section 2

Table 6.2.1 – Evaluation of Options for Cycle Routing through Section 2

Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A EPR	Option B Shared on-road facility	Option C Ringsend Park Route	Option D Options B and C combined
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Journey Time reliability (Buses)	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact
	Rank				
	Capital Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Reconstruction and realignment of York Road / Pigeon House Road required. High Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Road markings only Low Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Widening and lighting of existing route through park and local interventions along footpaths and at road crossings Mid-range Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Widening and lighting of existing route through park and local interventions along footpaths and at road crossings Road markings on York Road / Pigeon House Road Mid-range Cost
	Land Acquisition Cost	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a
	Rank				
Economy					
Integration	Integration with Land-Use policy	Connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Indirect connection to East Coast Trail provided. Does not align with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Low quality connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Low quality connection to East Coast Trail provided. Does not align with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Connection to East Coast Trail provided. Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Two connections to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Connection to East Coast Trail provided. Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan
	Rank				
	Residential Population and Employment Catchments	Fewer houses served	Fewer houses served	More central routing serving a greater population	More central routing serving a greater population
	Rank				
	Public Transport Network	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services.
	Rank				
	Cycle Network	Connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Indirect connection to East Coast Trail provided. Does not align with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Low quality connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Low quality connection to East Coast Trail provided. Does not align with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Connection to East Coast Trail provided. Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Two connections to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Connection to East Coast Trail provided. Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan
	Rank				
Traffic Network	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	
Rank					
Integration					
Accessibility and Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors (Education / Health / Commercial / Employment)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank				
	Deprived Geographic Areas	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank				

Table 6.2.1 – Evaluation of Options for Cycle Routing through Section 2					
Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A EPR	Option B Shared on-road facility	Option C Ringsend Park Route	Option D Options B and C combined
Accessibility and Social Inclusion					
Safety	Road Safety	Good separation of cars and cyclists	Cyclists shared with cars in traffic calmed environment.	Good separation of cars and cyclists	Good separation of cars and cyclists
	<i>Rank</i>				
Safety					
Environment	Flora and Fauna	Impact on green space on York Road / Pigeon house Road	No impacts	Potential impacts of lighting and removal of green space in Ringsend Park.	Potential impacts of lighting and removal of green space in Ringsend Park.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Archaeology & Cultural Heritage	Impacts on historic quay wall.	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Soils and Geology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Hydrology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Land Use and the Built Environment	Removal of parking on Pigeon House Road required.	No impacts	Removal of some parking at Bremen Road required.	Removal of some parking at Bremen Road required.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Noise, Vibration and Air Quality	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>				
Landscape and Visual	Significant reconfiguration of Pigeon House Road required. Significant works on east side of Ringsend Park	No appreciable impacts.	Some local impacts on Ringsend Park.	Some local impacts on Ringsend Park.	
<i>Rank</i>					
Environment					

Table 6.2.2 – Evaluation of Options for Cycle Route at Irishtown

Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A EPR Proposal	Option B Kerlogue Road Route	Option C Modified Strand Street Route	Option D Bremen Road Route	Option E Options B or C and D combined
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Journey Time reliability (Buses)	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact	Journey Time Reliability Factors No impact
	Rank					
	Capital Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Cycle track: 300m Mid-Range Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Road markings and local interventions for road crossings only Low Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors Cycle track: 300m Mid-range Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors 300m long with minor widening of existing footpath. Low Cost	Infrastructure Works Cost Factors 600m length. Higher Cost
	Land Acquisition Cost	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a	Land Acquisition Cost n/a
	Rank					
Economy						
Integration	Integration with Land-Use policy	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank					
	Residential Population and Employment Catchments	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank					
	Public Transport Network	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services	No impact on public transport services.	No impact on public transport services.
	Rank					
	Cycle Network	Indirect Connection to Poolbeg SDZ Connection to East Coast Trail Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Indirect connection to Poolbeg SDZ. Connection to East Coast Trail Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Indirect connection to Poolbeg SDZ Connection to East Coast Trail Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Direct Connection to Poolbeg SDZ. No connection to East Coast Trail. Does not fully align with GDA Cycle Network Plan	Additional connection to Poolbeg SDZ provided. Connection to East Coast Trail provided. Aligns with GDA Cycle Network Plan
Rank						
Traffic Network	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	
Rank						
Integration						
Accessibility and Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors (Education / Health / Commercial / Employment)	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	Rank					
	Deprived Geographic Areas	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options

Table 6.2.2 – Evaluation of Options for Cycle Route at Irishtown						
Assessment Criterion	Assessment Sub-Criterion	Option A EPR Proposal	Option B Kerlogue Road Route	Option C Modified Strand Street Route	Option D Bremen Road Route	Option E Options B or C and D combined
	<i>Rank</i>					
Accessibility and Social Inclusion						
Safety	Road Safety	Good separation of cars and cyclists	Cyclists shared with cars in traffic calmed environment.	Good separation of cars and cyclists	Good separation of cars and cyclists	Best separation of cars and cyclists since all desire lines catered for
	<i>Rank</i>					
Safety						
Environment	Flora and Fauna	Impacts on trees at Strand Street. Some loss of open green space.	Least loss of open green space	Some loss of open green space	Some loss of open green space	Most loss of open green space
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Archaeology & Cultural Heritage	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.	No impacts on heritage assets.
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Soils and Geology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Hydrology	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Land Use and the Built Environment	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Noise, Vibration and Air Quality	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Landscape and Visual	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options	No appreciable difference between options
	<i>Rank</i>					
Environment						